

## ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION AGENDA

Tuesday, August 16, 2016

6:00 p.m.

50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room B

Applicants or their representatives must attend this meeting. If applicants are absent it is likely that the application will be continued until the Commission's next meeting. If you have any questions, please call Connie Torbeck (645-0664) in the City's Historic Preservation Office. If you need assistance in participating in this meeting due to a disability under the ADA, please call the City's ADA Coordinator at (614) 645-6504 or email raisbell@columbus.gov at least three (3) business days prior to the scheduled meeting or event to request an accommodation.

- I. CALL TO ORDER
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Tuesday, September 13, 2016 –  
50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room A
- III. NEXT COMMISSION MEETING – 6:00 pm, Tuesday, September 20, 2016 –  
50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room B
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS PRESENT
- VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, July 19, 2016.
- VII. PUBLIC FORUM
- VIII. STAFF APPROVALS
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

### **STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS**

**1. 16-8-14 (not required to attend)**

**157-161 Warren Street**

**Arthur James (Applicant/Owner)**

*An application, photographs, and door cut sheet have been submitted. Multi-lite door to second floor was approved for replacement February 2016.*

Install New Front Doors

- Remove the two (2) existing, original, wood front doors and transoms.
- Install new, wood, ¾ lite, doors and wood transoms in the existing openings.

Install New Side Door

- Remove the one (1) existing, non-original, wood, six-panel door and the wood transom on the east/Hamlet Street elevation.
- Install new, wood, ¾ lite, door and wood transom in the existing opening.



2. **16-8-15** (*not required to attend*)

**185 East Second Avenue**

**Priestas Brothers Builders (Applicant)**

**Catriona Van Dyck (Owner)**

*An application, photographs, site plan, and elevation drawings have been submitted.*

**Build New Garage**

- Construct a new, 16' x 22', frame, single-car garage, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.
- Siding to be 2 ½" HardiPlank, to match profile on house.
- Wood trim to be per the submitted elevation drawings.
- Shingles from approved roofing list to be installed on the 6/12 pitch roof.
- Wood overhangs to be 8" on all elevations.
- Foundation to be 8" concrete block.
- One 10' x 7' door to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- One two-panel, half-lite service door on side elevation to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

3. **16-8-16** (*not required to attend*)

**775-777 Summit Street**

**Urban Order Architecture (Applicant)**

**Dean Berlon & Steve Hurtt (Owner)**

*An application, photographs, and site plan have been submitted.*

**Patio and Landscaping**

- Install a new brick patio in the rear yard of each of the two units, per the submitted site plan.
- Install new planting beds, per the submitted site plan.

**Install New Fence**

- Remove existing fence wood fence, and install new 6'H, wood privacy fence with gates to the alley, per the submitted site plan.
- Location of new fence to be per the submitted site plan to provide for new parking pad.

**Parking Pad**

- Install new, concrete parking pad in area of existing, compacted gravel parking area.

**Install Drain & Repair Sidewalk**

- Install a new drainline for existing downspout beneath concrete service sidewalk.
- Repair/replace existing service sidewalk, as needed.

**Install New Storm Windows**

- Install new, low profile, metal storm windows (insert location).
- New storm windows to be installed inside the existing window frame.
- Storm window color to match the primary trim color as closely as possible.
- Double caulk to provide air-tight installation on top and sides. Do not caulk breather holes.
- Horizontal bar on all new storm windows to align with horizontal sash bar on existing windows.
- Storm windows to operate smoothly.
- All work to be in accordance with the performance manual.

4. **16-8-17** (*not required to attend*)

**186 Warren Street**

**Dan Linden (Applicant/Owner)**

*An application, photographs, site plan, and paver material have been submitted.*

**New Patio**

- Install a new, approximately 150 sq. ft., paved patio area at the rear entrance, per the submitted site plan.
- Brick paver color to be per the submitted photo example.



5. **16-8-18** (*not required to attend*)

**1171 Say Avenue**

**Genevi Schindehutte (Applicant/Owner)**

*An application, photographs, site plan, and paver material have been submitted.*

New Retaining Wall

- Remove the existing, wood and concrete retaining wall at the front of the property.
- Install a new, stone retaining wall in the same location, per the submitted drawing.
- Wall to be 1' H to the left of the sidewalk and 1.5' H to the right.
- New stone to be Olen Valley thin wallstone, or similar, per the submitted product cut sheet.

6. **16-8-19** (*not required to attend*)

**942 Mt. Pleasant Avenue**

**Benjamin Ogg (Applicant/Owner)**

*An application, photographs, site plan, and paver material have been submitted.*

New Patio and Landscaping

- Install a new paved patio between the existing house and garage, per the submitted site plan.
- Patio material to be Unilock Hollandstone "Coffee Creek."
- Install new sod and plantings, per the submitted site plan.

New Fence

- Remove existing fence along the alley, and install new, 6'H, wood privacy fence and gate, per the submitted site plan.
- Repair the existing wood privacy fence along the north side of the property, as needed.

**HOLDOVERS**

**IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 6:10 P.M.**

7. **16-7-19**

**1167 Say Avenue**

**Marc Manack, Architect (Applicant)**

**Bradley Strickling (Owner)**

*This application was continued from the July 19<sup>th</sup> IVC hearing at the request of and in the absence of the Applicant. An application, photographs, site plan, and statement of hardship have been submitted. A two-story dwelling on this lot was demolished ca. 1977.*

Request for Variance Recommendation

1. Section 3312.15, R-4 area district requirements, requires a lot area of no less than 6,000sf for a two story, two family dwelling. We are requesting a variance to permit a two story, two family dwelling on the existing lot which has an area of 3,352sf (including 6' to the centerline of the rear alley per 3312.18). The size of the lot and the two family use are compatible with existing structures and uses on similar lots in the vicinity including 1173 Say Avenue amongst others.
2. Section 3312.18, Lot Coverage. The proposed project covers 56% of the lot area (including second floor terraces at east and west) which is greater than the 50% allowable per 3312.18. The coverage is dictated by the up/down two-family use and attached garage. The lot coverage is compatible with existing structures and uses on similar lots in the vicinity including 1173 Say Avenue and 42-46 East 4th Avenue amongst others.
3. Section 3332.19, Frontage. Dwellings are required to front upon a public street. Per City Planning, Say Avenue does not qualify as a public street because it is not 35 ft. in width. This is a technical variance, but needs to be approved in order for a structure to be built on this property. We are requesting a variance to build on 1167 Say Avenue.
4. Section 3332.27, Rear Yard, requires a rear yard of no less than 25% of the total lot area. We are requesting a variance to permit a rear yard area of 15%. Due to the shape of the existing site, the variance is being requested to comply with the front setback and to accommodate an



attached garage with the required off street surface parking at the rear.

5. Section 3312.09, Maneuvering. Per the code, 20 ft. of maneuvering clearance is required into the surface parking spaces. Due to the shape of the existing site, and because of the attached garage configuration, the maneuvering clearance provided in the current scheme varies from 13'-18' which is generous compared to existing projects (both older and recently built) on nearby lots adjoining the alley including 42-46 East 4th Avenue. The maneuvering clearance is in addition to the 18'x18' surface parking area provided.

**8. 16-7-21 (not attending)**

**85 East First Avenue #5**

**Able Roof (Applicant)**

**David Buhlman (Owner)**

*This application was continued from the July 19<sup>th</sup> IVC hearing to allow time for the Applicant to work with staff to explore alternative material window options. Applicant requests to be continued to the September 20<sup>th</sup> IVC hearing.*

Install New Windows

- Remove the nine (9) existing, wood, three-over-one, double-hung sash windows.
- Install new, vinyl windows, per the submitted product cut sheet.

**NEW APPLICATIONS**

**IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 6:20 P.M.**

**9. 16-8-12a**

**1105 Say Avenue**

**Heather Minor (Applicant)**

**Joel Oney & Travis Sanders (Owners)**

*Application #16-8-12 has been divided into item 'a' for Italian Village Commission review under Staff Recommendations, and item 'b' for Staff Approval under Staff Approved items (see below).*

Install New Door Opening

- Remove the existing, window on the rear elevation, per the submitted photographs.
- Install a new door opening with, wood French doors, per the submitted photograph.

Install New Stoop

- Install a new, semi-circular, wood stoop at the new door opening, per the submitted site plan.

Fence and Landscaping

- Install new, 2' H, wrought iron fence in front yard, per the submitted site plan and example photograph.
- Install new planting bed in front yard, per the submitted site plan.

**10. 16-8-20 (not required to attend)**

**1014 North High Street**

**Brent Racer/New Avenue Architects & Engineers (Applicant)**

**Fireproof Partners, LLC (Owner)**

*An application, photographs, site plan, and signage drawings have been submitted.*

Expand Patio

- Extend the existing outdoor seating area to wrap around the facade of the tenant space, per the submitted drawing.
- Remove a section of the existing railing and existing foliage, per the submitted site plan.
- Install new railings along the High Street façade, to match existing, per the submitted site plan.

New Projecting Sign

- Remove existing, projecting, Tai Tiki sign.
- Install one (1) new, double-faced, wood sign, with sandblasted text "Julep," per the submitted rendering.
- Size and round shape of new sign to match existing sign.
- Install two (2) new light fixtures to illuminate sign, per the submitted rendering.



New Awning Sign

- Remove the two existing, red fabric awnings.
- Install two new, black fabric awnings, with the business name “Julep” on the front flap of each awning.

**IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 6:30 P.M.**

**11. 16-8-21**

**1150 Summit Street**

**Michael Dorsey (Applicant/Owners)**

*An application, photos, site plan, elevation drawings, and cut sheets have been submitted.*

New Addition

- Construct a new, two-story, rear addition, per the submitted site plan and drawings.
- Existing one-story, rear addition to be expanded by 60 sq. ft. (5' x 12').
- Second story to be added above the existing one-story rear addition.
- Exterior siding to match existing, wood-grain, 8” aluminum siding or fiber cement, board-and-batten siding.
- Windows to be one-over-one, double-hung sash and horizontal transom sash, per the submitted product cut sheet/specifications.
- Move existing first floor window at southeast corner to the 5' addition on the first floor.
- Paint existing house and addition Sherwin Williams “Indigo Blue” with white trim.

New Fence

- Install new, 36” H, black, “Belleville,” aluminum fence and gate at front property line, per the submitted site plan and product cut sheet.

**IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 6:45 P.M.**

**12. 16-8-22**

**990 Summit Street**

**Brendan Gibbons (Applicant)**

**Connie Klema (Owner)**

*An application, photos, site plan, and cut sheets have been submitted.*

New Retaining Wall

- Install two U-shaped sections of stone retaining wall at the front of the property, per the submitted site plan and example photographs.
- Wall to be approximately 30” H (approx. 5 courses), Versi-lock with full nose cap, tapering into grade as it returns toward house.
- Stone to be

Install New Fence

- Install a new, 48” H, wrought iron fence along the front property line at 990 Summit Street (2<sup>nd</sup> unit from left).
- Install a new wrought iron fence at the rear of the house, between 990 and the neighboring house to the south.
- Fence to be Fortin Ironworks F5S, per the submitted product cut sheet.



**IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 7:00 P.M.**

**13. 16-8-23**

**1100 North High Street**

**Jeff Parenteau (Applicant)**

**Giannopoulos Properties (Owner)**

*An application, photos, site plan, and product example photos have been submitted.*

Landscape/Hardscape

- Pave the existing asphalt parking area with a combination of stamped concrete and washed gravel, per the submitted site plan and product cut sheets.
- Install plantings, per the submitted site plan and plant list.

Install Skylights

- Install three (3) skylights in the rear patio canopy, per the submitted drawings and photo example.
- Install standing-seam-metal siding on the exterior walls of the patio area, per the submitted drawings.

**IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 7:20 P.M.**

**14. 16-8-24**

**25 Jeffrey Park Condominiums**

**Chad Seiber/21 Jeffrey Park, LLC (Applicant)**

**21 Jeffrey Park, LLC (Owner)**

*An application, photos, site plan, and product example photos have been submitted.*

Landscape Plan

- Install new planting beds in front of individual condo units, per the submitted site plan.
- Install new courtyard with plantings, seating blocks, and metal fence, per the submitted site plan.
- Existing trees in tree lawn along Sixth Street and Auden Avenue, to remain.

**15. 16-8-25**

**959 North Sixth Street**

**Mulberry Design & Build, LLC (Applicant)**

**955 N. Sixth St., LLC. (Owner)**

*An application, photos, site plan, and revised elevation drawings have been submitted. COA # 14-11-26 (December 16, 2014) specified installation of "limestone headers and sills, to be solid, not split" for this new construction.*

Modify Previous Approval/New Construction/Sills & Lintels

- Retain the existing brick sills, as installed, prior to review and approval.
- Omit installation of limestone headers/lintels, that were approved 6-16-2014.

**16. 16-8-26**

**97 Ottar Alley**

**Mulberry Design & Build, LLC (Applicant)**

**1081-1089 Summit St., LLC. (Owner)**

*An application, photos, site plan, and revised elevation drawings been submitted. This application modifies COA # 15-2-10 (February 17, 2015).*

Modify Previous Approval/New Construction

- Eliminate limestone sills and lintels, that were approved 2-17-2015.
- Replace barnwood siding, that was approved 2-17-2015, with vertical metal siding, as per the revised drawings.

Landscape/Hardscape

- Install a new, ornamental concrete 12' x 12' patio and concrete walkway on the south side of the property, per the submitted site plan.
- Install a new, wood, rear entrance deck with handrail on the south side of the property, per the submitted site plan.
- Install a new, front entry patio on the north side of the property, per the submitted site plan.
- Install a new, 6' H, horizontal board fence on the south side of the property, per the submitted site plan.
- Install plantings on north and south sides of the property, per the submitted plantings list.





**17. 16-8-27**

**963 North Sixth Street**

**Autumnwood Homes, LLC c/o Mulberry (Applicant)**

**Autumnwood Homes, LLC (Owner)**

*An application, photos, floor plan, and revised elevation drawings been submitted. This application modifies COA # 15-9-21b (November 17, 2015).*

Modify Previous Approval/New Construction/Front Porch

- Change front entry steps to be perpendicular to front porch, per the submitted elevation drawings.

Modify Previous Approval/New Construction/Rear Porch

- Modify rear steps/stoop, per the submitted elevation drawing.

Exterior Colors

- Body of house to match the submitted Marvin window color sample “Gunmetal” gray.
- Front door to be Sherwin Williams “Iron Ore.”

**18. 16-8-28 (not required to attend)**

**270 East Third Avenue**

**Jody Dierksheide (Applicant/Owner)**

*An application, photos, floor plan, and revised elevation drawings been submitted.*

Landscape/Hardscape

- Install new Trex decking, flanked by water features, at garage, per the submitted rendering and site plan.
- Install new concrete paver patio and walkways, per the submitted site plan and example photographs.
- Install new gas fire feature, per the submitted rendering.

**CONCEPTUAL REVIEW**

**IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 8:00 P.M.**

**19. 16-8-29**

**273 East Greenwood Avenue**

**Ross Rhinehart (Applicant)**

**Flying Ace Warehouses/Ross & Kathy Rhinehart (Owners)**

*An application, site plan, and example tiny house photographs have been submitted.*

Create Tiny House Village

- Create a tiny house village with seven (7) tiny houses, on the existing vacant lot.

**IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 8:20 P.M.**

**20. 16-8-30**

**608-610 N. High Street & 14-20 E. Poplar Street**

**Antonio Colosimo/3D Group, Inc. (Applicant)**

**C&W 608 N. High LLC (Owner)**

*An application, photos, floor plans, and elevation drawings have been submitted.*

New Storefront/West Elevation

- Remove the existing, inset entrance and two storefronts. Retain full-light doors for reuse.
- Rebuild as a single storefront, with one entrance at the north end and one entrance at the south end.
- Re-glaze existing transoms above façade storefront.
- Existing second floor windows to remain.
- Existing exterior light fixtures to remain.
- Removed existing canvas awnings and install new canvas awnings.

New Storefronts/South Elevation/Western Group of Three

- Westernmost grouping of three storefronts to consist of a central garage door, opening to patio space, flanked by storefront windows, per the submitted drawings.



- Center storefront to be removed completely.
- Transoms and storefronts on flanking storefronts to be re-glazed and wood knee-walls restored.

Individual Pedestrian Doors

- Replace the existing door, east of the westernmost group of storefronts with new hollow metal door for access to basement. Paint to blend in with adjacent brick walls.
- Retain the adjacent, existing, full-light, wood door for access to second floor tenant space.

New Storefronts/South Elevation/Western Group of Three

- Easternmost grouping of four storefronts to consist of one storefront with clear glazing and three storefronts with opaque glazing at new restrooms and kitchen.

East Elevation

- Cut wall for new door on rear elevation.
- Infill void above new door, per the submitted drawings.
- New metal door to be painted to blend in with adjacent brick walls.

Chimney Removal

- Remove the three (3) existing, brick chimneys.

**IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 8:35 P.M.**

**21. 16-8-31**

**296 East Fourth Avenue**

**Ryan Keener/Mode Architects (Applicant)**

**Fairfax Homes, Inc. (Owner)**

*An application, photos, site plan, floor plans, and elevation drawings have been submitted.*

New Construction/House

- Build a new, single-family, two-story dwelling, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.
- Exterior siding to be wood.
- Roofing to be asphalt shingles and EPDM.
- Rear balcony to have cable railing.

New Construction/Garage

- Build a new, detached, two-car garage, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.
- Garage to have two, 9' x 7', overhead garage doors on the north elevation and one window and service door on the south elevation.
- Exterior siding to be wood.
- Roofing to be asphalt shingles.

**22. 16-8-32**

**762 Waldron Street/Jeffrey Park/Phase IV/Garage**

**Rob Harris (Applicant)**

**Jeffrey New Day, LLC. (Owner)**

*An application, photos, site plan, floor plans, elevation drawing, and lighting plan have been submitted.*

New Parking Garage & Apartments

- Build a new parking garage, with apartment units on the south and west elevations, per the submitted drawings.





**IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 9:10 P.M.**

**23. 16-8-33**

**750 North High Street**

**Brian Peterson (Applicant)**

**Columbus Metropolitan Housing Authority (Owner)**

*This project was conceptually reviewed at the June 21, 2016 IVC hearing. An application, photos, site plan, and elevation drawing have been submitted.*

Renovation for Hotel

- Renovate the existing Bollinger Tower building for use as a commercial hotel.
- Hotel to include a maximum of 190 rooms, including conference rooms and exercise facility.
- Additional off-site, valet parking spaces to be leased to supplement 35 existing, on-site spaces.
- Existing windows to be removed and replaced with units integrating the necessary mechanical grilles.
- Existing EIFS exterior walls and sunscreens to be painted.
- Two single-story build-out structures will be added to the High Street portion of the site, including a 1500 sq. ft. retail space to the north, and an expansion to the hotel lobby spaces with roof terrace to the south.
- Retail building to include a combination of aluminum storefront and stone veneer.
- Hotel lobby expansion to include a combination of brick and aluminum storefront.

*The following is from the June 21, 2016 IVC hearing:*

Commissioner Comments

David Cooke:

- *The existing green space is not very successful. In the first renovation, the Commission wanted the building brought out to the street.*
- *Consider adding a two level parking structure to address additional parking.*
- *Would like to see the store line brought out to fill in the streetscape.*
- *Not in favor of the proposed windows for the banquet room. If the building was brought out further, the window placement could be different.*
- *Not opposed to changing the grill system.*
- *The proposed three signs is too much signage.*
- *Maximize the site, add parking, bring it out to the street and consider storefronts or other leased space.*

Charmaine Sutton:

- *Agrees with Commissioner Cooke's idea to bring the building to the street.*

Rex Hagerling:

- *In agreement with Commissioner Cooke's comments.*
- *Is very concerned about going from 100 apartments with many residents who don't have cars, to 190 hotel rooms.*
- *Coming out to the street with two stories would be helpful.*
- *Is concerned that the building could end up looking like a suburban hotel.*
- *Understands that the louvres are a challenge, but not sure about how the panelization would work yet.*

Todd Boyer:

- *Also agrees with Commissioners Cooke and Hagerling.*
- *Currently it is sort of a background building. Would try to leave it that way. Does not want to see it move towards a more suburban look.*
- *The signage seems really high, which is not necessary since this building does not have freeway access.*
- *Thinks pulling the building to the street could be hugely successful.*

Jason Sudy:

- *The existing outdoor space, including the paving materials and trees, is not very successful.*
- *If there is not a physical expansion of the building toward the street, would not want to see a large scale outdoor space/patio right at the street that would be unused for a large part of the year.*



- *The signage needs to be a quality piece. Should not have a suburban feel. Look at other urban hotels, like the Joseph, as examples.*
  - *A one-story parking deck could pose some challenges that may not be ideal for the neighborhood.*
- NO ACTION TAKEN.**

**IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 9:20 P.M.**

**24. 16-8-34**

**900 North High Street**

**Elford Development/United Dairy Farmers, Inc. (Applicant)**

**United Dairy Farmers, Inc. (Owner)**

*This project was conceptually reviewed at the July 19, 2016 IVC hearing. An application, photos, floor plans, and renderings have been submitted.*

Demolition

- *Demolish the existing, one-story commercial building.*

New Construction

- *Construct a new, four-story, mixed use building.*
- *Proposed use to be retail, restaurant, and office space.*
- *Multiple patio or rooftop terraces proposed.*
- *Thirteen on-site parking spaces proposed.*

*The following is from the July 19, 2016 IVC hearing:*

Commissioner Comments

David Cooke:

- *Concerned that the covered patio “H” will be a negative corner during fall/winter months. Would rather see the area infilled, or a NanaWall or something that maintains the storefront.*
- *Sidewalks along Pearl Alley will be important to the discussion. Pedestrians cannot be forced to walk in the alley.*
- *Retail spaces “C” and “D” seem too small. Has concerns that they will not stay occupied. Would rather see a couple of spaces lost in parking area “I” in order to have those spaces expanded.*
- *Would like more information on the dumpster area.*
- *Need to look at a more urban solution to signage. Will not be placed up high on the buildings.*
- *Thinks the windows of the south building are a more suburban format. Consider a smaller, punched window type.*
- *There should be more of a separation between the Donatos, across First Avenue, and the beginning of this development.*
- *Does the rear elevation need so many windows? Need to protect the residential experience on First Avenue.*
- *Appreciates that details have been carried around from High Street to First Avenue. Does not see that connection yet with the Pearl Alley side.*

Josh Lapp:

- *Thinks it would be better to have a taller piece on the corner.*
- *Thinks the rear parking can work if there is some head in parking but there is still a sidewalk and a comfortable space for pedestrians to walk. Perhaps diagonal parking could help.*
- *Assumes Pearl Alley will be redone.*
- *The overhang on the rear seems to create negative space at street level. Concerned about how it would relate to the streetscape. Any way to make it a more pedestrian friendly would be a positive.*

Rex Hagerling:

- *Likes that it looks distinctly like three separate buildings. The one in the center could be more pronounced.*
- *Wouldn’t automatically say that the larger windows need to be changed to smaller, punched windows.*
- *Three stories is a nice transition from the Donatos across First Avenue. The scale seems similar to what has been on High Street historically. Does not want to see 7+ story buildings on High Street.*



- *Does not like that the rear is one monolithic structure with no detail.*
- *Agrees about the negative space on the corner. Perhaps a recess could be worked in somewhere else for exterior space.*
- *Excited about the possibilities of this project.*
- *Also concerned about the small retail spaces.*

Ben Goodman:

- *In agreement with many of the comments made.*
- *Conceptually, does not have an issue with the patio space “H.” Sees it as activating the street.*
- *Thinks the proportions and mass are appropriate. Would be willing to see it going up another story. The details of how the buildings meet the sky would be important when viewed along High Street.*
- *Will be interested in the details along Pearl Alley and how this building relates to adjacent houses.*

Jason Sudy

- *Does not like the patio recess on the corner.*
- *Thinks there is an opportunity to add outdoor space along First Avenue.*
- *Agrees that spaces “C” and “D” are too shallow.*
- *Would be open to a portion of the development being a bit taller.*
- *Will need more detail regarding how the rear parking meets Pearl Alley. Look at a transition material/paver/rumble strip. It will be a unique condition, but not necessarily a bad condition.*
- *The rear overhang could work, if done well.*
- *This project is a great and positive change for this area.*
- *While a parking lot is being lost on High Street, it has never been an improved lot.*
- *This project will bring a variety of times-of-day uses, which will be a big help to the street.*
- *Does not think the existing 1970s building is contributing or has any historic characteristics.*

**NO ACTION TAKEN**

**IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 9:35 P.M.**

**25. 16-8-35**

**1086 North Fourth Street**

**Karrick Sherrill/Shremshock Architects (Applicant)**

**1086 N. Fourth St. LS LLC/Lykens Cos. (Owner)**

*This project was conceptually reviewed at the April, May, and June 2015 IVC hearings. An application, photos, site plan, floor plans, and elevation drawings have been submitted.*

Façade (West) Elevation/Main Building

- Existing second floor windows to remain.
- Existing main entry to remain.
- Install new windows in existing first floor openings.
- Install new steps down to “Space B Patio.”

Rear (East) Elevation/Main Building

- Existing smoke stack to remain.
- Install new windows in existing openings to south of smoke stack.
- Infill existing window opening to north of smoke stack.
- Existing brick walls to remain.

North Elevation/Main Building

- Existing windows in front section to remain.
- Install new simulated-divided-light (SDL) windows in existing window openings of rear section.
- Existing dairy doors to remain.

South Elevation/Main Building

- Existing windows in front section to remain.
- Install new simulated-divided-light (SDL) windows in existing window openings of rear section.
- Install new steps down to space “A” lobby, near east end of south elevation.



- Install new entry and awning near west end of south elevation.
- Install new platform and landscaping.

South Elevation/Garage & Warehouses

- Existing overhead doors on garage to be removed. Brick walls and openings to be retained.
- Install new SDL windows in existing window openings of three warehouse buildings.
- Install new storefront in two existing overhead door openings.

Inset West Elevation/Warehouse (previously an interior wall)

- Leave window and door openings open, without doors or windows.
- Install new storefront in existing overhead door opening.
- Install new SDL windows in existing window openings.

North Elevation/Garage & Warehouses

- Install new SDL windows in existing window openings.
- Three existing window openings to remain open with no windows.
- Existing brick walls to remain.
- Existing overhead doors on garage to be removed. Brick walls and openings to be retained.

East Elevation/Warehouse

- Install new SDL windows in the existing window openings of the warehouse facing onto N. Sixth Street.

*The following is from the June 16, 2015 IVC hearing:*

Commissioner Comments

Jason Sudy:

- *Very relieved that the Applicant has taken a new direction and will be preserving the Budd Dairy warehouses.*
- *Could be supportive of the demolition of the 1960s garage and the proposed open-air parking within the 1949 warehouse. Will be important to wrap the corner with the wall.*
- *Although retaining exterior walls only is not a general preservation practice, this particular warehouse is fire damaged, and retaining the overall north elevation of the multiple warehouses is more important than the building behind it.*
- *Will need to start considering any type and location of fencing within the development.*
- *Thinks that any parking near Fourth Street can be resolved with appropriate screening.*
- *Following the Commission's interior/exterior site visit of the buildings on May 4<sup>th</sup>, feels comfortable with the demolition of the Durable Slate building.*
- *Thinks the proposed scale for the overall development is appropriate. The phasing is smart.*
- *Take another look at moving the garage entrance from Detroit Avenue to the alley.*

Josh Lapp:

- *Will be interested to see the details of how the north elevation walls of the warehouses will work together.*
- *Glad to know the warehouses will be saved. Feels good about the new direction of the development.*
- *Consider reusing some of the brick from the demolished building for paving. Consider paving materials other than concrete or asphalt for parking areas, if possible.*

David Cooke:

- *The north wall provides a good opportunity to provide some history of the building through art or photography.*
- *Could support the demolition of the Durable Slate building, but would want the stone lintels to be retained and reused in some capacity.*
- *Thinks it is critical to move the garage entrance from Detroit Avenue around to the alley. Curb cuts belong on the alleys and not on main streets.*
- *Thrilled that the warehouses will be saved.*
- *Would not want to see a series of new door fronts where they did not exist before.*



Todd Boyer:

- No additional comments.

Charmaine Sutton:

- No additional comments.

Rex Hagerling:

- In basic agreement with comments of fellow commissioners.
- The demolition of the Durable Slate building is contingent upon what would replace it. Need more details regarding that proposed building. Agrees that there needs to be an expression of the stone pieces on the front of the existing building.
- Will be interested in the details of the building to be used for open-air parking.

NO ACTION TAKEN

**IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 9:45 P.M.**

**26. 16-8-36**

**848 North Pearl Street**

**Connie J. Klema, Attny. (Applicant)**

**Wood Run Partners, LLC (Owner)**

*A new, six-story condominium building with ground floor parking was conditionally approved June 16, 2015, with all final details to return for review and approval. An application for a modified design with office space use was conceptually reviewed June 21, 2016.*

New Construction

- Build a new, five-story, office building, per the submitted renderings.
- Exterior siding to be fiber-cement panels with concealed fasteners, painted aluminum panels, and standing-seam-metal.
- First floor to be ground face block.
- Garage openings to be painted, bar-stock metal grating.

*The following is from the June 21, 2016 IVC hearing:*

Commissioner Comments

Ben Goodman:

- Has concerns about the proposed height of the building, especially the mansard on the east side makes the building seem more bloated.

David Cooke:

- Is as much space needed for rooftop mechanicals as is currently proposed?
- Since this will be office space now, look at whether all the balcony space is needed.
- Could the canopy on Prescott be pulled back?
- Consider using climbing hydrangeas or something that would add more green to a space that will be between two parking structures.
- Thinks the artwork could fill the whole wall at the corner of Prescott and Pearl.

Todd Boyer:

- Would also like to see the artwork extended.
- If the balconies are kept, the soffit details will be important.
- Will need to see details of the HardiBoard application (seams).
- Need more information about where the mechanicals will be located.
- Will need more information on any required parking variances.

Charmaine Sutton:

- No additional comments.

Josh Lapp:

- Nothing to add. Thinks it is moving in a good direction.





Rex Hagerling:

- *Appreciates the effort, but remains opposed to the project.*
- *Thinks it is too high and too big for the location.*

Jason Sudy:

- *One advantage of changing the use to office space is it gives it more air on the Prescott side with the floor to ceiling ratios and the full expanse of glass.*

**NO ACTION TAKEN.**

**27. 16-8-37**

**839 Summit Street**

**Ben Goodman & Chris Zuelke (Applicants/Owners)**

*An application, plan, and drawings have been submitted.*

Build New Garage

- Build a new, three-car, shared wall garage
- New garage to be utilized by 839 Summit Street and the neighboring property owner at 843 Summit Street.
- Concrete block garage to have a stepped parapet with metal coping, per the submitted drawings.
- Two, plain, steel overhead doors.
- Service doors to be half-light, steel or fiberglass.
- Goose neck light fixtures to be above each auto and service door.

**STAFF APPROVALS**

• **16-8-1**

**137 Warren Street**

**Stacy Woodford (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application 16-8-1, 137 Warren Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Eave Soffit & Fascia Repair:

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood eave soffits and fascia on all elevations as necessary with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer, according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.

Repair/Replace Gutters & Downspouts

- Examine all existing, metal, ogee (k-style) gutters on the house and make any repairs and/or replace the existing gutter system on all elevations with new metal, ogee (k-style) gutters.
- Install new, corrugated metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

• **16-8-2**

**76 East Third Avenue**

**Roger Farrell (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application 16-8-2, 76 East Third Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the north section of the roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.





- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
  - Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
  - Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
  - Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be GAF, Slateline (dimensional), "English Gray Slate," to match existing.
  - All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
  - Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

• **16-8-3**

**972-974 North Fourth Street**

**Allison Adams (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application 16-8-3, 972-974 North Fourth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color to be: Body – "Redstone Blue Spruce;" Trim – "Homestead Resort Jefferson White."
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., stone/concrete foundation is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

• **16-8-4**

**289 Auden Avenue/Jeffrey Park Beacon Townhome**

**Rob Harris (Applicant)**

**Jeffrey New Day, LLC. (Owner)**

Approve Application 16-8-4, 289 Auden Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

New Construction

- Construct a new, brick townhome, per the submitted drawings.
- Windows to be aluminum.
- Window to have limestone sills and soldier course brick headers.
- All work to be completed per the original approval and modifications, as noted below, and as shown in the submitted drawings dated 07/13/16.

Note: Original approval was on November 19, 2013 (COA # 13-11-17); modified August 18, 2015 (COA # 15-7-17) and March 22, 2016 (COA # 16-3-13a).



- **16-8-5**

**Short North Arts District Arches/High Street- Multiple Locations**

**Short North Alliance (Applicant)**

**City of Columbus (Owner)**

Approve Application 16-8-5, High Street/Multiple Locations, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install New Banners

- Remove the existing banners, and install new banners on the seventeen (17) Short North Arches, per the submitted renderings. Two (2) banners to be installed on each arch (34 total banners).
- Banners to be 18” x 54” double-faced vinyl and hung on custom aluminum poles, per the submitted drawing.
- Banners to be installed from late August through early-November.

- **16-8-6**

**838-840 Kerr Street**

**Ron Miller (Applicant)**

**CD & C Newby Ltd. (Owner)**

Approve Application 16-8-6, 838-840 Kerr Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be GAF, Slateline (dimensional), “English Gray Slate,” to match existing.
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “gray” or “Tinner’s Red.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “gray” or “Tinner’s Red.”  
Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

- **16-8-7**

**939 Summit Street**

**Todd Thatcher (Applicant)**

**New Village Place (Owner)**

Approve Application 16-8-7, 939 Summit Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Satellite Dish

- Retain the existing cable service satellite dish, as installed prior to review and approval.
- The dish is located at the rear of the property adjacent to the parking area, and is not attached to the building.

- **16-8-8**

**779 Summit Street**

**Ingrid Navarro (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application 16-8-8, 779 Summit Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Exterior Painting/Doors

- Paint all exterior doors on the house and garage, per the submitted photographs.
- Color to be SW 0048, “Bungle House Blue.”



- **16-8-9**

**41 East Prescott Street**

**Kenneth & Michele Gagen (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application 16-8-9, 41 East Prescott Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install New Patio

- Install a new patio with stone border, per the submitted site plan, specifications, and material samples.
- Pavers to be “Old World” with Oberfields Dimensional wall block. Color to be “Cuyahoga.”
- New walkway to be Unilock Eco Priora River.

Planting Beds

- Install new planting beds at edge of patio, per the submitted site plan.

- **16-8-10**

**1057 Summit Street**

**Hakeem Shittu (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application 16-8-10, 1057 Summit Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Repair/Replace Gutters & Downspouts

- Examine all existing, metal, ogee (k-style) gutters on the house and make any repairs and/or replace the existing gutter system on all elevations with new metal, ogee (k-style) gutters.
- Install new, corrugated metal downspouts in the appropriate locations, as needed, to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications. Paint colors to match existing.

House Numbers

- Replace the missing digits of the house number with new digits, to match existing.

- **16-8-11**

**964-966 North Fourth Street**

**David J. Scaglione (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application 16-8-11, 964-966 North Fourth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Exterior Stairs

- Retain the existing exterior, wood steps, stoop, and railings, as repaired/replaced prior to review and approval.
- The stairs were an existing feature and were repaired/replaced in-like-kind.

Install New Vinyl Windows and Siding

- Retain the existing vinyl siding and vinyl windows on the one-story rear addition, as installed prior to review and approval.
- The vinyl windows and vinyl siding were existing features and were replaced in-like-kind.

Install New Vinyl Transoms

- Retain the existing vinyl, two door and two window transoms on the front elevation, as installed prior to review and approval.
- Vinyl windows were installed at this property sometime prior to 2009. Transoms were replaced in-like-kind.

Note: An Historic Commission Review Application must be submitted prior to any future work.



- **16-8-12b**

**1105 Say Avenue**

**Heather Minor (Applicant)**

**Joel Oney & Travis Sanders (Owners)**

*Application #16-8-12 has been divided into item 'a' for Italian Village Commission review under Staff Recommendations (see above), and item 'b' for Staff Approval under Staff Approved items.*

Approve Application 16-8-12b, 1105 Say Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color scheme to be as follows: Body – SW 7074 "Software;" Gables – SW7075 "Web Gray;" Front Doors – SW9059 "Silken Peacock."

Install New Door

- Remove the existing, non-contributing, steel door on the front elevation.
- Install a salvaged, wood door, per the submitted photographs.
- New door to be painted to match existing parlor door.

Install New Privacy Fence

- Remove the existing chain link fence, in agreement with the neighboring property owner.
- Install a section of new six-feet high (6' H), wood privacy fence in the same location, along the south side yard, with a gate extending to the corner of the house, per the submitted site plan.
- Style of the new wood fence is to be selected from one (1) of the following appropriate options: a) Board-on-board, six-feet high (6' H), straight-cut or dog-eared (not stockade) wood fence-finished side out facing the neighboring properties (i. e. all stringers and posts placed on the inside); b) Board-on-board, six-feet high (6' H), straight-cut or dog-eared (not stockade) wood fence with vertical 1" x 6" boards placed on both sides of the stringers; or c) Board-on-board, six-feet high (6' H), wood fence with all straight-cut vertical boards installed with a top and bottom rail cap placed between the 4" x 4" wood posts.
- Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

- **16-8-13**

**1080 Say Avenue**

**Molly W. & Susan C. Orlos (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application 16-8-13, 1080 Say Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color scheme to be as follows: Body – "Sage Green;" Trim - "Forest Green" and "Cream"; Accent – "Burgundy."



- X. OLD BUSINESS**
- XI. NEW BUSINESS**
- XII. ADJOURNMENT**

